



May 1, 2025

VIA EMAIL

Office of General Counsel
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20580
foia@ftc.gov

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear FOIA Officer:

Pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the implementing regulations of the Federal Trade Commission (FTC), 16 C.F.R. Part 4, American Oversight makes the following request for records.

As part of its consumer protection responsibilities, the FTC publishes guidance to help businesses comply with FTC regulations in areas such as advertising, consumer privacy and technology.¹ In March 2025, the Trump administration removed four years' worth of FTC guidance from its website, including advice to tech companies on how to protect consumer privacy.² American Oversight seeks records with the potential to shed light on the FTC's enforcement priorities and efforts to protect consumers by publishing guidance to businesses.

Requested Records

American Oversight requests that the FTC produce the following records within twenty business days:

1. All email communications (including emails, email attachments, complete email chains, calendar invitations, and calendar invitation attachments) sent by any of the FTC officials listed below, or anyone communicating on their behalf, such as an assistant or scheduler, to any email address ending in .com, .co, .us, .net, .org, .mail, .edu, .law, .legal, .ch, .me, or .group.

Federal Trade Commissioners:

- i. Commissioner Melissa Holyoak
- ii. Commissioner Andrew Ferguson

¹ See Federal Trade Commission, Business Guidance, *available at* <https://www.ftc.gov/business-guidance>.

² Makena Kelly, *FTC Removes Posts Critical of Amazon, Microsoft, and AI Companies*, Wired, Mar. 18, 2025, <https://www.wired.com/story/federal-trade-commission-removed-blogs-critical-of-ai-amazon-microsoft>.



In an effort to accommodate your office and reduce the number of potentially responsive records to be processed and produced, American Oversight has limited part 1 of its request to emails sent by Commissioner Holyoak and Commissioner Ferguson. To be clear, however, American Oversight still requests that complete email chains be produced, displaying both sent and received messages. This means, for example, that both Commissioner Holyoak's response to an email from an email address ending in .com and the initial received message are responsive to this request and should be produced.

2. All email communications (including emails, email attachments, complete email chains, calendar invitations, and calendar invitation attachments) between (a) any of the FTC officials listed in part 1 of this request, or anyone communicating on their behalf, such as an assistant or scheduler, and (b) anyone in the White House Office (including anyone communicating from an email address ending in @who.eop.gov).

Please note that American Oversight does not seek, and that part 2 of this request specifically excludes, the initial mailing of news clips or other mass-distribution emails. However, subsequent communications responding to or forwarding such emails are responsive to this request. In other words, for example, if Commissioner Melissa Holyoak received a mass-distribution news clip email from the White House, that initial email would not be responsive to this request. However, if she forwarded that email to another listed individual with her own commentary, that subsequent message would be responsive to this request and should be produced.

3. All email communications (including emails, email attachments, complete email chains, calendar invitations, and calendar invitation attachments) between (a) any of the FTC officials listed in part 1 of this request, or anyone communicating on their behalf, such as an assistant or scheduler, and (b) anyone communicating on behalf of the U.S. DOGE Service, the U.S. DOGE Service Temporary Organization, or the Department of Government Efficiency ("DOGE"), including but not limited to from an email address containing "doge.gov" or "doge.eop.gov"

Please note that American Oversight does not seek, and that part 3 of this request specifically excludes, the initial mailing of news clips or other mass-distribution emails. However, subsequent communications responding to or forwarding such emails are responsive to this request. In other words, for example, if Commissioner Melissa Holyoak received a mass-distribution news clip email from any email address ending in @doge.gov, that initial email would not be responsive to this request. However, if she forwarded that email to another listed individual with her own commentary, that subsequent message would be responsive to this request and should be produced.

4. All calendars or calendar entries for any of the FTC officials listed in part 1 of this request, including any calendars maintained on their behalf.

American Oversight requests that the calendars be produced in a format that includes all invitees, any notes, and all attachments. Please do not limit your search to electronic calendars; we request the production of any calendar — paper or electronic, whether on government- issued or personal devices — used to track or coordinate how the officials allocate their time on agency business.

This search should include any calendars associated with Commissioner Melissa Holyoak and Commission Andrew Ferguson’s accounts, as well as any official calendars maintained for them, including by an aide, assistant, or scheduler.

5. All formal or informal final guidance, recommendations, memoranda or directives created by, issued to, or otherwise provided to the FTC regarding the removal of blog posts or web content from www.ftc.gov, including, but not limited to business guidance, business advisories, or consumer protection information.³

For Parts 1-5 of this request, please provide all responsive records from January 20, 2025, through the date the search is conducted.

6. All email communications (including emails, email attachments, complete email chains, calendar invitations, and calendar invitation attachments) sent by (a) any of the FTC officials listed in part 1 of this request, or anyone communicating on their behalf, such as an assistant or scheduler, and (b) containing any of the key terms listed below.

Key terms:

- i. “business guidance”
- ii. “business-guidance”
- iii. Khan
- iv. Slaughter
- v. Bedoya
- vi. COPPA
- vii. “Children’s Online”
- viii. “children online”
- ix. Xbox
- x. “Lesley Fair”
- xi. “Amazon Ring”
- xii. “Hey, Alexa!”
- xiii. “Federal Records Act”
- xiv. “Open Government Data Act”

³ *Id.*

- xv. OpenAI
- xvi. ChatGPT
- xvii. Gemini

For Part 6 of this request, please provide all responsive records from March 1, 2025, through the date the search is conducted.

Fee Waiver Request

In accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and your agency's regulations, American Oversight requests a waiver of fees associated with processing this request for records. The subject of this request concerns the operations of the federal government, and the disclosures will likely contribute to a better understanding of relevant government procedures by the general public in a significant way. Moreover, the request is for non-commercial purposes.

American Oversight requests a waiver of fees because disclosure of the requested information is "in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of operations or activities of the government."⁴ The public has a significant interest in the FTC's efforts to protect consumers and issue guidance to businesses. Records with the potential to shed light on this issue would contribute significantly to public understanding of operations of the federal government, including how the FTC communicates with the business sector and the public. American Oversight is committed to transparency and makes the responses agencies provide to FOIA requests publicly available, and the public's understanding of the government's activities would be enhanced through American Oversight's analysis and publication of these records.

This request "is not primarily in the commercial interest of the requester."⁵ In fact, as a 501(c)(3) nonprofit, American Oversight does not have a commercial purpose, and the release of the information requested is not in American Oversight's commercial interest. American Oversight's mission is to promote transparency in government, to educate the public about government activities, and to ensure the accountability of government officials. American Oversight uses the information gathered, and its analysis of it, to educate the public through reports, press releases, or other media. American Oversight also makes materials it gathers available on its public website and promotes their availability on social media platforms, such as Facebook and X (formerly Twitter).⁶

American Oversight has also demonstrated its commitment to the public disclosure of documents and creation of editorial content through regular substantive analyses posted

⁴ 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii).

⁵ *Id.*

⁶ American Oversight currently has approximately 16,000 followers on Facebook and 94,900 followers on X (formerly Twitter). American Oversight, Facebook, <https://www.facebook.com/weareoversight/> (last visited Apr. 30, 2025); American Oversight (@weareoversight), X (formerly Twitter), <https://x.com/weareoversight> (last visited Apr. 30, 2025).

to its website.⁷ Examples reflecting this commitment include the posting of records related to the first Trump Administration’s contacts with Ukraine and analyses of those contacts;⁸ posting records and editorial content about the federal government’s response to the COVID-19 pandemic;⁹ posting records received as part of American Oversight’s “Audit the Wall” project to gather and analyze information related to the first Trump administration’s proposed construction of a barrier along the U.S.-Mexico border, and analyses of what those records reveal;¹⁰ the posting of records related to an ethics waiver received by a senior Department of Justice attorney and an analysis of what those records demonstrated regarding the Department’s process for issuing such waivers;¹¹ and posting records and analysis of federal officials’ use of taxpayer dollars to charter private aircraft or use government planes for unofficial business.¹²

Accordingly, American Oversight qualifies for a fee waiver.

Guidance Regarding the Search & Processing of Requested Records

In connection with its request for records, American Oversight provides the following guidance regarding the scope of the records sought and the search and processing of records:

⁷ See generally *Our Latest*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/blog>.

⁸ *The Trump Administration’s Contacts with Ukraine*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/the-trump-administrations-contacts-with-ukraine>.

⁹ See generally *The Trump Administration’s Response to Coronavirus*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/the-trump-administrations-response-to-coronavirus>; see, e.g., *CDC Calendars from 2018 and 2019: Pandemic-Related Briefings and Meetings*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/cdc-calendars-from-2018-and-2019-pandemic-related-briefings-and-meetings>.

¹⁰ See generally *Audit the Wall*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/audit-the-wall>; see, e.g., *Audit the Wall: No Plans, No Funding, No Timeline, No Wall*, American Oversight, <https://americanoversight.org/audit-the-wall-no-plans-funding-or-timeline-and-no-wall/>.

¹¹ *DOJ Records Relating to Solicitor General Noel Francisco’s Recusal*, American Oversight, <https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/25544090-doj-records-relating-to-solicitor-general-noel-franciscos-recusal-american-oversight>; *Francisco & the Travel Ban: What We Learned from the DOJ Documents*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/francisco-the-travel-ban-what-we-learned-from-the-doj-documents>.

¹² See generally *Swamp Airlines: Chartered Jets at Taxpayer Expense*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/investigation/swamp-airlines-private-jets-taxpayer-expense>; see, e.g., *New Information on Pompeo’s 2017 Trips to His Home State*, American Oversight, <https://www.americanoversight.org/new-information-on-pompeos-2017-trips-to-his-home-state>.

- Please search all locations and systems likely to have responsive records, regardless of format, medium, or physical characteristics. For instance, if the request seeks “communications,” please search all locations likely to contain communications, including relevant hard-copy files, correspondence files, appropriate locations on hard drives and shared drives, emails, text messages or other direct messaging systems (such as iMessage, WhatsApp, Signal, or X (formerly Twitter) direct messages), voicemail messages, instant messaging systems such as Lync or ICQ, and shared messages systems such as Slack.
- In conducting your search, please understand the terms “record,” “document,” and “information” in their broadest sense, to include any written, typed, recorded, graphic, printed, or audio material of any kind. We seek records of any kind, including electronic records, audiotapes, videotapes, and photographs, as well as letters, emails, facsimiles, telephone messages, voice mail messages, and transcripts, notes, or minutes of any meetings, telephone conversations, or discussions.
- Our request for records includes any attachments to those records or other materials enclosed with those records when they were previously transmitted. To the extent that an email is responsive to our request, our request includes all prior messages sent or received in that email chain, as well as any attachments to the email.
- Please search all relevant records or systems containing records regarding agency business. Do not exclude records regarding agency business contained in files, email accounts, or devices in the personal custody of your officials, such as personal email accounts or text messages. Records of official business conducted using unofficial systems or stored outside of official files are subject to the Federal Records Act and FOIA.¹³ It is not adequate to rely on policies and procedures that require officials to move such information to official systems within a certain period of time; American Oversight has a right to records contained in those files even if material has not yet been moved to official systems or if officials have, by intent or through negligence, failed to meet their obligations.¹⁴
- Please use all tools available to your agency to conduct a complete and efficient search for potentially responsive records. Agencies are subject to government-wide requirements to manage agency information electronically,¹⁵ and many

¹³ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, 827 F.3d 145, 149–50 (D.C. Cir. 2016); cf. *Judicial Watch, Inc. v. Kerry*, 844 F.3d 952, 955–56 (D.C. Cir. 2016).

¹⁴ See *Competitive Enter. Inst. v. Office of Sci. & Tech. Policy*, No. 14-cv-765, slip op. at 8 (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2016).

¹⁵ Presidential Memorandum—Managing Government Records, 76 Fed. Reg. 75,423 (Nov. 28, 2011), <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/11/28/presidential-memorandum-managing-government-records>; Office of Mgmt. & Budget, Exec. Office of the President, Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments & Independent Agencies, “Managing Government Records

agencies have adopted the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) Capstone program, or similar policies. These systems provide options for searching emails and other electronic records in a manner that is reasonably likely to be more complete than just searching individual custodian files. For example, a custodian may have deleted a responsive email from his or her email program, but your agency's archiving tools may capture that email under Capstone. At the same time, custodian searches are still necessary; agencies may not have direct access to files stored in .PST files, outside of network drives, in paper format, or in personal email accounts.

- In the event some portions of the requested records are properly exempt from disclosure, please disclose any reasonably segregable non-exempt portions of the requested records. If a request is denied in whole, please state specifically why it is not reasonable to segregate portions of the record for release.
- Please take appropriate steps to ensure that records responsive to this request are not deleted by the agency before the completion of processing for this request. If records potentially responsive to this request are likely to be located on systems where they are subject to potential deletion, including on a scheduled basis, please take steps to prevent that deletion, including, as appropriate, by instituting a litigation hold on those records.

Conclusion

If you have any questions regarding how to construe this request for records or believe that further discussions regarding search and processing would facilitate a more efficient production of records of interest to American Oversight, please do not hesitate to contact American Oversight. American Oversight welcomes an opportunity to discuss its request with you before you undertake your search or incur search or duplication costs. By working together at the outset, American Oversight and your agency can decrease the likelihood of costly and time-consuming litigation in the future.

Where possible, please provide responsive material in an electronic format by email. Alternatively, please provide responsive material in native format or in PDF format on a USB drive. Please send any responsive material being sent by mail to American Oversight, 1030 15th Street NW, Suite B255, Washington, DC 20005. If it will accelerate release of responsive records to American Oversight, please also provide responsive material on a rolling basis.

We share a common mission to promote transparency in government. American Oversight looks forward to working with your agency on this request. If you do not understand any part of this request, please contact Ben Sparks at foia@americanoversight.org or 202.873.1741. Also, if American Oversight's request for

Directive," M-12-18 (Aug. 24, 2012), <https://www.archives.gov/files/records-mgmt/m-12-18.pdf>.

a fee waiver is not granted in full, please contact us immediately upon making such a determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Ben Sparks
Ben Sparks
on behalf of
American Oversight